

# **Assessment of Perceived Quality of Healthcare Services by Out-Patients Attending Primary Healthcare Facilities in A Selected Local Government Area in Kwara State, Nigeria**

AUTHOR(S): BAMIDELE, Feyisayo Iyabo (RN, RM, RNE, BNSc, MPH)  
AND

OKAFOR, Ngozi Anthonia (RN, RM, RPHN, PhD)

## **Abstract**

The perception of patient about quality healthcare differs because the mode of rendering healthcare services and what is considered quality healthcare services differs from one Primary Health Care (PHC) centre to another. The study therefore assessed the perceived quality of healthcare services by out-patients attending PHC facilities in a selected local government area, Ilorin, Kwara-State, Nigeria. A quantitative design (descriptive survey) was used for the study. The sample consisted of 394 respondents drawn through multi-stage sampling. A pretested, self-administered questionnaire was used to collect data. The data was analysed with SPSS version 20 and subjected to descriptive statistics. The findings revealed that most of the respondents had poor perception of patient-centred healthcare services; 54.8% disagreed that healthcare providers involve them in decisions concerning their care; 53.6% agreed that healthcare providers show understanding when listening to patients; 51.8% agreed that the hospital environment does not pose any physical or mental danger to them or their babies; 62.9% agreed the care they receive produce the expected results; 54.3% agreed that patients wait longer than expected to see a doctor/nurse or other healthcare worker; majority of the respondents, 62.7% disagreed that the hospital uses innovative ways to avoid delays in healthcare delivery; 61.7% were moderately satisfied with the information given to them about their care; while 48.2% were dissatisfied with the cleanliness of the

**CJAR**

Accepted 28 April 2021  
Published 30 April 2021  
DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.4746958



waiting, treatment and toilet facilities. The study concluded that dimensions of healthcare quality perceived by patients significantly contributed to overall levels of satisfaction with healthcare services in PHC facilities. Therefore, it is recommended that, management of PHC facilities should focus on the quality, cleanliness, responsive services, as well as focus on improving the communication skills of staff in terms of compassion, politeness and active listening.

**Keywords:** Assessment, Quality, Healthcare Services, Perception,

#### About Author

**Author(s): BAMIDELE, Feyisayo Iyabo (RN, RM, RNE, BNSc, MPH)**

Department of Community/Public Health Nursing,  
School of Nursing Science,  
Babcock University, Ilishan-Remo, Ogun State, Nigeria.

And

**OKAFOR, Ngozi Anthonia (RN, RM, RPHN, PhD)**

Department of Public Health Nursing,  
School of Nursing Science,  
Babcock University, Ilishan-Remo, Ogun State, Nigeria.



## Introduction

Assessment of Quality of Healthcare services by out-patients is the understanding of patients who are not hospitalised about what makes up quality of healthcare in the services received at the healthcare facilities. In other words, it is what the patients assert constitute quality healthcare services via their assessment, these out-patients according to this study are women of reproductive age, and World Health Organization, (2020), refers to all women within the ages 15–49 years. The World Health Organization (WHO)'s declaration of quality of care is “the level at which healthcare services delivered to individuals increase awaited health results. In order to achieve this, health care need to remain effective, safe, timely, proficient, unbiased and patient-centred” (World Health Organization, 2019). Primarily, the commonly accepted attribute of quality healthcare services is the typical practice of medical practitioners. However, the viewpoint of patients about the rendered services should be the major criteria to determine quality healthcare (Kausar, Shahzad, Zubia, & Moazzam, 2017).

The increasing dissatisfaction of patients about the health care services they got from primary health care facilities is becoming a public concern. Health care sector is one of the most important sectors in a country, as it influences other areas and has medical, social, political, moral, business, and financial implications and outcomes. Absence of health nullifies the importance of everything, including every achievement (Javed, et al., 2018). According to Ephraim-Emmanuel, et al., (2018), the pace of development of quality primary health care services in Nigeria as highlighted in their review remains quite unsatisfactory.

A study revealed that Nigeria, a densely populated nation with a world health system ranking of 187 of 200 countries, still has weak health care standards and accreditation systems, poor quality health care services, unfair distribution and inadequate health care service delivery (Ephraim-Emmanuel, et al, 2018). It is well reported that if patients' level of satisfaction on quality of care does not meet their standard, they may choose to look for treatment elsewhere and satisfied patients are likely to show favourable behavioural intentions, which are helpful to the healthcare provider's long-term success (Kudra & Bernard, 2014). Also, with the researcher's dealings with patients at primary health centres, a lot of patients asserted they were not satisfied with most of the healthcare services they got at the health care facilities. Some claimed they are delayed for several hours before been attended to while some claimed that their view is not considered in healthcare services that are rendered. As a result of these, patients move from one health facility to another in search of satisfaction.

Over the years, it has been convenient to gather information regarding quality health care delivery from patients that are admitted for number of days. This is because in-patients are certain to receive care for a long time and they can easily express their views about the care being rendered, as a result of this, many researchers focused on the in-patients with little consideration given to out-patients. This opens a gap to assess the perceived quality of healthcare services by out-patients attending primary healthcare facilities in Ilorin East Local Government Area, Ilorin, Kwara-state, Nigeria. This will help to identify areas of health care services that need improvement at the primary healthcare facilities.

Thus, in view of these problems, the study investigated the perceived quality of healthcare services by out-patients' attending primary health facilities in Ilorin East Local Government Area of Ilorin. This study specifically:

1. assess the perception of safety of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State;
2. explore the perception of the effectiveness of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State;

3. determine the perception of out-patients about the patient-centeredness of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State;
4. ascertain the perception of timeliness of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State;
5. identify the perception of efficiency of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State;
6. examine the perception of equitability of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State;
7. find out the overall levels of satisfaction with healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State; and
8. measure the relationship between demographic characteristics and dimensions of quality of healthcare services.

### Research Questions

The following research questions were raised for this study:

1. What is the perception of safety of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?
2. What is the perception of effectiveness of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?
3. How is patient-centered healthcare service perceived by out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.?
4. How is timely healthcare service perceived by out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?
5. What is the perception of efficiency of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?
6. How is equitability of healthcare services perceived by out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?
7. What are the overall levels of satisfaction with healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?

### Methodology

The research design was quantitative, adopting a cross-sectional descriptive survey method. The population for the study consisted of females of reproductive age (15 – 49 years) attending Antenatal clinics, Immunization/Infant welfare clinics, and Family Planning clinics in the 10 selected primary healthcare facilities. The total population was 2776. The sampling size was 384 patients from the 10 selected primary healthcare facilities in the selected local government area. 10% attrition of 38 was added to the figure to get 422 sample size. The sample size was calculated using Leslie Kish formula (1965). The study was based on simple balloting, proportional and convenient sampling techniques.

To measure quality of healthcare services among mothers attending antenatal clinic, infant welfare/immunization clinic and family planning clinic in the primary healthcare facilities in Ilorin East Local Government Area of Ilorin, the researcher designed a structured



questionnaire which was divided into eight (8) sections comprising A, B, C, D, E, F, G and H. Face and content validity of the instrument was assured by presenting a copy to experts in the field of community health. Unclear and ambiguous items were reframed before final administration for data collection. Test re-test method was used to ensure reliability of the questionnaire. The reliability coefficient generated for the pilot study generally was 0.76. The research questions were answered using descriptive statistics of frequency, percentage and mean based on the objectives of the study.

## Results

**Research Question 1:** What is the perception of safety of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?

Table 1: Out-patients' perception of safety of healthcare N= 394

S/N	ITEMS	SA (%)	A (%)	U (%)	D (%)	SD (%)	Mean
1.	I believe the services I receive here are safe	61 (15.5)	152 (38.6)	145 (36.8)	18 (4.6)	18 (4.6)	3.56
2.	I believe the information I received at the healthcare facility is accurate	43 (10.9)	162 (41.1)	103 (26.1)	70 (17.8)	16 (4.1)	3.37
3.	The healthcare services provided at healthcare facility is free from errors	99 (25.1)	159 (40.4)	103 (26.1)	33 (8.4)	0 (0.0)	3.82
4.	The hospital environment does not pose any physical or mental danger to me or my baby	105 (26.6)	204 (51.8)	69 (17.5)	16 (4.1)	0 (0.0)	4.01
5.	Sometimes the information provided by the healthcare providers is misleading.	110 (27.9)	211 (53.6)	73 (18.5)	0 (0.0)	0 (0.0)	4.09
6.	Laboratory results are always accurate	117 (29.7)	103 (26.1)	103 (26.1)	55 (14.0)	16 (4.1)	3.63
7.	I trust that the treatment I receive will not harm me in any way	134 (34.0)	139 (35.3)	85 (21.6)	18 (4.6)	18 (4.6)	3.90
8.	I had some complications in the past from the treatments I received in this healthcare facility	6 (1.5)	74 (18.8)	136 (34.5)	175 (44.4)	3 (0.8)	2.76
9.	The hospital environment is clean and safe	29 (7.4)	199 (50.5)	79 (20.1)	71 (18.0)	16 (4.1)	3.39

**Mean Cut-Off: 3.0** (Key: SA - Strongly Agree; A - Agree; U - Undecided; D - Disagree; SD - Strongly Disagree)

Table 1 revealed that, most of the respondents, 53.6% (Mean = 4.09) agreed that, sometimes the information provided by the healthcare providers is misleading; 51.8% (Mean = 4.01) agreed that the hospital environment does not pose any physical or mental danger to them or their babies; Based on the mean cut-off of 3.0, out of the 9 items raised on perception of safety of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin East local government area of Kwara State, most of the respondents agreed to 8 items (item 1 – 7 & 9).

This implies that most of the respondents had good perception of safety of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.



**Research Question 2:** What is the perception of effectiveness of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?

**Table 2: Out-patients' perception of effectiveness of healthcare services N= 394**

S/N	ITEMS	SA (%)	A (%)	U (%)	D (%)	SD (%)	Mean
1.	Treatment given at the healthcare services is appropriate	33 (8.4)	180 (45.7)	71 (18.0)	90 (22.8)	20 (5.1)	3.29
2.	The healthcare service providers give assistance when needed	20 (5.1)	180 (45.7)	50 (12.7)	124 (31.5)	20 (5.1)	3.14
3.	You are given a reason why you are kept waiting	39 (9.9)	229 (58.1)	21 (5.3)	85 (21.6)	20 (5.1)	3.46
4.	Health services (vaccines and family planning methods) are available almost every time	40 (10.2)	200 (50.8)	81 (20.6)	58 (14.7)	15 (3.8)	3.49
5.	Drugs are available when prescribed and they work for me	15 (3.8)	213 (54.1)	31 (7.9)	130 (33.0)	5 (1.3)	3.26
6.	The healthcare services are of high quality	6 (1.5)	259 (65.7)	70 (17.8)	39 (9.9)	20 (5.1)	3.49
7.	The interventions have meaningful effects on me	80 (20.3)	156 (39.6)	89 (22.6)	69 (17.5)	0 (0.0)	3.63
8.	The care I receive produce the expected results	31 (7.9)	248 (62.9)	40 (10.2)	55 (14.0)	20 (5.1)	3.55

**Mean Cut-Off: 3.0**

Table 2 revealed that, majority of the respondents, 65.7% (Mean = 3.49) agreed that the health care services given at the facilities are of high quality; 62.9% (Mean = 3.55) agreed the care they receive produce the expected results.

Based on the mean cut-off of 3.0, most of the respondents agreed to all 8 items generated on perception of effectiveness of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

It can be concluded that most of the respondents had good perception of effectiveness of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

**Research Question 3:** How is patient-centered healthcare services perceived by out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?

**Table 3: Out-patients' perception of patient-centered healthcare services N= 394**

S/N	ITEMS	SA (%)	A (%)	U (%)	D (%)	SD (%)	Mean
1.	Adequate information is provided about my treatment options	19 (4.8)	102 (25.9)	54 (13.7)	202 (51.3)	17 (4.3)	2.76
2.	Healthcare providers show understanding when listening to patients	96 (24.4)	212 (53.8)	55 (14.0)	31 (7.9)	0 (0.0)	3.95
3.	Healthcare providers explain things in the language that is easy to understand	100 (25.4)	208 (52.8)	36 (9.1)	31 (7.9)	19 (4.8)	3.86
4.	Healthcare providers request	19	81	40	198	56	2.52

	feedback on the quality of healthcare provided	(4.8)	(20.6)	(10.2)	(50.3)	(14.2)	
5.	Complete and sufficient explanations are provided about why laboratory tests are requested and about the results	6 (1.5)	153 (38.8)	39 (9.9)	162 (41.1)	34 (8.6)	2.84
6.	Patients are treated with respect and dignity	0 (0.0)	106 (26.9)	77 (19.5)	178 (45.2)	33 (8.4)	2.65
7.	The healthcare providers involve me in decisions regarding my care	19 (4.8)	58 (14.7)	63 (16.0)	216 (54.8)	38 (9.6)	2.50

**Mean Cut-Off: 3.0**

Table 3 revealed that most of the respondents, 54.8% (Mean = 2.50) disagreed that the healthcare providers involve them in decisions concerning their care; 51.3% (Mean = 2.52) disagreed that adequate information is provided about their treatment options; 50.3% (Mean = 2.52) also disagreed that, healthcare providers request feedback on the quality of healthcare provided.

Item 1, 4, 5, 6 and 7 with mean value of 2.76, 2.52, 2.84, 2.65 and 2.50 did not meet the mean cut-off value of 3.0.

It can be concluded that most of the respondents had poor perception of patient-centred healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

**Research Question 4:** How is timely healthcare services perceived by out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?

Table 4: Out-patients' perception of timeliness of healthcare services N= 394

S/N	ITEMS	SA (%)	A (%)	U (%)	D (%)	SD (%)	Mean
1.	It takes much time to walk around the healthcare facility before being attended to by health providers	121 (30.7)	182 (46.2)	55 (14.0)	19 (4.8)	17 (4.3)	3.94
2.	Patients wait longer than expected to see a doctor/nurse/other healthcare worker	78 (19.8)	214 (54.3)	20 (5.1)	82 (20.8)	0 (0.0)	3.73
3.	Healthcare providers attend to patients promptly when called upon	20 (5.1)	112 (28.4)	81 (20.6)	144 (36.5)	37 (9.4)	2.83
4.	Patients wait for many hours to submit specimens at the laboratory and to retrieve tests result	77 (19.5)	203 (51.5)	37 (9.4)	58 (14.7)	19 (4.8)	3.66
5.	Patients are schedule for unsuitable dates for subsequent visits	20 (5.1)	166 (42.1)	168 (42.6)	40 (10.2)	0 (0.0)	3.42
6.	The healthcare facility has the capacity to provide care quickly	0 (0.0)	56 (14.2)	80 (20.3)	232 (58.9)	26 (6.6)	2.42
7.	The hospital uses innovative ways to avoid delays in healthcare delivery	0 (0.0)	101 (25.6)	30 (7.6)	247 (62.7)	16 (4.1)	2.55

8.	The services are accessible and available	20 (5.1)	107 (27.2)	142 (36.0)	86 (21.8)	39 (9.9)	2.96
9.	Complications that arise are handled quickly	20 (5.1)	67 (17.0)	77 (19.5)	191 (48.5)	39 (9.9)	2.59

**Mean Cut-Off: 3.0**

Table 4 revealed that majority of the respondents, 62.7% (Mean = 2.55) disagreed that the hospital uses innovative ways to avoid delays in healthcare delivery; and 58.9% (Mean = 2.42) also disagreed that, the healthcare facility has the capacity to provide care quickly.

Most of the respondents, 54.3% agreed that patients wait longer than expected to see a doctor/nurse/other healthcare worker.

Most of the respondents only agreed to 4 items while they disagreed to 5 items generated on timeliness of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

It can be concluded that most of the respondents had poor perception of timeliness healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

**Research Question 5:** What is the perception of efficiency of healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?

Table 5: Out-patients' perception of efficiency of healthcare services N= 394

S/N	ITEMS	SA (%)	A (%)	U (%)	D (%)	SD (%)	Mean
1.	Duplication and repetition of healthcare is prevented by healthcare providers	19 (4.8)	259 (65.7)	26 (6.6)	71 (18.0)	19 (4.8)	3.48
2.	Healthcare providers are proficient in healthcare delivery	18 (4.6)	262 (66.5)	57 (14.5)	38 (9.6)	19 (4.8)	3.56
3.	Healthcare providers provide healthcare voluntarily	38 (9.6)	181 (45.9)	45 (11.4)	111 (28.2)	19 (4.8)	3.27
4.	Healthcare providers empathize with patients' concerns	30 (7.6)	213 (54.1)	113 (28.7)	38 (9.6)	0 (0.0)	3.60
5.	Available equipment is functional	74 (18.8)	245 (62.2)	64 (16.2)	0 (0.0)	11 (2.8)	3.94
6.	The care I receive is appropriate for me	30 (7.6)	253 (64.2)	37 (9.4)	57 (14.5)	17 (4.3)	3.56
7.	The healthcare providers have the necessary skills to care for me	75 (19.0)	190 (48.2)	56 (14.2)	56 (14.2)	17 (4.3)	3.63

**Mean Cut-Off: 3.0**

Table 5 revealed that majority of the respondents 66.5% (Mean = 3.56) agreed that healthcare providers are proficient in healthcare delivery; 65.7% (Mean = 3.48) agreed that duplication and repetition of healthcare is prevented by healthcare providers; 64.2% (Mean = 3.56) agreed that the care they receive is appropriate for them; 62.2% (Mean = 3.94) agreed that available equipment is functional.

Most of the respondents agreed to all the 7 items generated on perception of efficiency of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.



It can be concluded that most of the respondents had good perception of efficiency of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

**Research Question 6:** How is equitability of healthcare services perceived by out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?



Table 6: Out-patients' perception of equitability of healthcare services N= 394

S/N	ITEMS	SA (%)	A (%)	U (%)	D (%)	SD (%)	Mean
1.	Each patient is treated as an individual	19 (4.8)	238 (60.4)	77 (19.5)	40 (10.2)	20 (5.1)	3.50
2.	I perceived my socioeconomic status as a barrier to healthcare services	0 (0.0)	70 (17.8)	46 (11.7)	239 (60.7)	39 (9.9)	2.37
3.	Healthcare providers give preference to patients according to religion	20 (5.1)	64 (16.2)	70 (17.8)	208 (52.8)	32 (8.1)	2.57
4.	Healthcare providers give preference to patients according to ethnic group	19 (4.8)	65 (16.5)	91 (23.1)	201 (51.0)	18 (4.6)	2.66
5.	Healthcare providers give preference to patients according to personal relationship	58 (14.7)	234 (59.4)	64 (16.2)	20 (5.1)	18 (4.6)	3.75
6.	Healthcare providers treat all patients equally	38 (9.6)	132 (33.5)	58 (14.7)	142 (36.0)	24 (6.1)	3.05
7.	I am given special/preferential treatment because of my state of origin	19 (4.8)	20 (5.1)	54 (13.7)	216 (54.8)	85 (21.6)	2.17
8.	Optimal Healthcare services are only given to those who can afford	55 (14.0)	138 (35.0)	88 (22.3)	94 (23.9)	19 (4.8)	3.29
9.	It is difficult to receive quality care if the healthcare providers do not know the patients	0 (0.0)	39 (9.9)	70 (17.8)	241 (61.2)	44 (11.2)	2.26

**Mean Cut-Off: 3.0**

Table 6 revealed that majority of the respondents 61.2% (Mean = 2.26) disagreed that it is difficult to receive quality care if the healthcare providers do not know the patients; 60.7% (Mean = 2.37) disagreed that socioeconomic status is perceived as a barrier to healthcare services.

Most of the respondents only agreed to 4 items while they disagreed to 5 items generated on equitability of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

Considering the items that were accepted and rejected by most of the respondents, it can be concluded that most of the respondents had good perception of equitability of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

**Research Question 7:** What are the overall levels of satisfaction with healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State?

Table 7: Out-patients' overall levels of satisfaction of healthcare services N= 394

S/N	ITEMS	HS (%)	MS (%)	U (%)	D (%)	HD (%)	Mean
1.	How satisfied are you with the information given to you about	12 (3.0)	243 (61.7)	60 (15.2)	60 (15.2)	19 (4.8)	3.43

	your healthcare?						
2.	How satisfied are you with the politeness of the healthcare providers?	18 (4.6)	145 (36.8)	24 (6.1)	186 (47.2)	21 (5.3)	2.88
3.	How satisfied are you with the healthcare services you get at the health facility?	21 (5.3)	180 (45.7)	93 (23.6)	97 (24.6)	3 (0.8)	3.30
4.	How satisfied are you with the adequacy of the waiting area, examination room and the treatment areas?	30 (7.6)	114 (28.9)	57 (14.5)	153 (38.8)	40 (10.2)	2.85
5.	How satisfied are you with the cleanliness of the waiting, treatment areas and the toilet facility?	18 (4.6)	129 (32.7)	57 (14.5)	190 (48.2)	0 (0.0)	2.94

**Mean Cut-Off: 3.0**

Table 4.8 revealed that majority of the respondents, 61.7% were moderately satisfied with the information given to you about your healthcare; 45.7% were also moderately satisfied with the healthcare services you get at the health facility.

Most of the respondents, 48.2% were dissatisfied with the cleanliness of the waiting, treatment areas and the toilet facility; and 47.2% were dissatisfied with the politeness of the healthcare providers.

The above table shows the overall levels of satisfaction with healthcare services among out-patients in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

**Discussion of Findings*****Perception of Safety of Healthcare Services***

The findings revealed that most of the respondents had good perception of safety of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State as 8 items out of 9 items raised were accepted by most of the respondents.

Most of the respondents, 152(38.6%) agreed that the services they receive are safe; 159(40.4%), agreed also that healthcare services provided at healthcare facility are free from errors; 204(51.8%) agreed the hospital environment does not pose any physical or mental danger to them. This signified that the respondents believed that the healthcare services at the facilities are safe, enhancing patients' satisfaction.

In support of this finding, Ephraim-Emmanuel, et al (2018) found that patients considered as respondent in their study had good perception of safety of healthcare services. Safe health care is crucial to achieving enhanced health benefits, patient safety and a positive patient experience of health care (Ephraim-Emmanuel, et al 2018)

***Perception of Effectiveness of Healthcare Services***

The findings revealed that most of the respondents had good perception of effectiveness of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State as all the 8 items raised were accepted by most of the respondents. Most of the respondents 248(62.9%), agreed that the care they receive produce the expected results: and 213(54.1%), agreed that drugs are available when prescribed and they work.

This implies that the healthcare services at the health care facilities are effective leading to patients' satisfaction.

This finding is in line with the submission of Tariq and Abdurrahman, (2016) who evaluated the current services of PHCs in Riyadh city from the perspective of patients. They concluded that the primary health care is in good order in Riyadh city; effective and accessible.

#### ***Perception of Patient-Centered Healthcare Services***

The findings revealed that most of the respondents had poor perception of patient-centred healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State.

Most of the respondents, 216(54.8%), disagreed that the healthcare providers involve them in decisions concerning their care; 202(51.3%), disagreed that adequate information is provided about their treatment, 198(50.3%), also disagreed that, healthcare providers request feedback on the quality of healthcare provided. This suggested that there are no adequate patient-centred healthcare services at the healthcare facilities leading to dissatisfaction.

A systematic review carried out by Berghout, Excel, Leensvaart and Cramm (2015) showed that, most of the respondents examined in their study had poor perception of patient-centred healthcare services. They concluded the establishments that are more patient-centered also have added optimistic results, such as better satisfaction with healthcare, greater job satisfaction among healthcare professionals, improved communication between patients and health professionals, increased quality and safety of care, and greater quality of life and well-being of patients.

#### ***Perception of Timeliness of Healthcare Services***

The findings revealed that most of the respondents had poor perception of timeliness healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State. Most of the respondents 247(62.7%), disagreed that the hospital uses innovative ways to avoid delays in healthcare delivery; 232(58.9), also disagreed that the healthcare facility has the capacity to provide care quickly. This hints that the healthcare services at the health facilities are not timely enough and the patients are not satisfied.

Ogunyemi, Ogunyemi, Olufunlayo and Odugbemi (2019) found that patients' satisfaction with health-care services in Africa was one of the most important factors determining the utilization of such services. They found that in a public primary health center (PHC) in Ogun state, Nigeria, 36.0% of the respondents indicated good staff attitude as the aspects of service most liked and the least liked aspect of service was the lack of timeliness in 43.0% of respondents.

Waiting times for elective and emergency procedures have been shown to predict satisfaction among service users. In emergency situations, delays in receiving appropriate treatment may also lead to preventable deaths (Calvella, Skog, Tenner, & Wallis, 2015).

Khan, Khalid, Almorsy and Khalifa (2016) concluded that it was reported by patients that they had to wait for long time before they could get their diagnostic procedures performed. This reveals poor aptness and availability of diverse laboratory tests that has great and a large effect on therapeutic results, course of illness and anticipated problems in addition to the effect on patient.

#### ***Perception of Efficiency of Healthcare Services***

The findings revealed that most of the respondents had good perception of efficiency of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State. Most of the respondents 259(65.7%), agreed that duplication and repetition of healthcare is prevented by healthcare providers, 262(66.5%), agreed that

healthcare providers are proficient in healthcare delivery, 245(62.2%), also agreed that available equipment are functional. This suggested that, healthcare services provided at the healthcare facilities are efficient.

In a study conducted by Ibrahim, Mohtar and Goron-Dutse (2015) on patient perception on Service Quality Improvement among Public and Private Healthcare Providers in Nigeria and Malaysia is in line with the findings of this present study, the results show 62.5% had good perception of efficiency of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities.

### ***Perception of Equitability of Healthcare Services***

The findings revealed that most of the respondents had good perception of equitability of healthcare services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State. Most of the respondents 238(60.4%), agreed that each patient is treated as an individual; 241(61.2%), disagreed that it was difficult to receive quality care if the healthcare providers do not know the patients. This signifies that there is equitable provision of healthcare services in the healthcare facilities.

Equitable healthcare services have been described as the provision of health care in such a way that, its quality does not vary based on personal characteristics which include geographic location, ethnic background, religion, age, gender and socio-economic status. In support of this finding, O'Neil, Naeve and Rajani (2017) in a study in India, reported that more than 80 percent of patients reported that they were satisfied with their treatment and care because their opinions were considered in their care.

### ***Overall Levels of Satisfaction with Healthcare Services***

The findings revealed that most of the respondents were satisfied with the information given to them about their healthcare 243(61.7%), (Mean = 3.43) and were satisfied with the healthcare services they get at the health facility, 180(45.7%), (Mean = 3.30). However, it was revealed that most of the respondents were dissatisfied with the politeness of the healthcare providers, 186(47.2%), (Mean = 2.88); adequacy of the waiting area, examination room and the treatment areas, 153(38.8%), (Mean = 2.85); and cleanliness of the waiting, treatment areas and the toilet facility, 190(48.2%), (Mean = 2.94).

### **Conclusion**

Sequel to the findings of this study, it is concluded that out-patients have good perception of safety, effectiveness, efficiency and equitability of healthcare services while they have poor perception of patient-centred and timeliness of health care services in Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities in Ilorin east local government area of Kwara State. It is also concluded that most of the out – patients were satisfied with the information given to them about their healthcare and healthcare services they get at the health facility while they were dissatisfied with the politeness of the healthcare providers; adequacy of the waiting area, examination room and the treatment areas; and cleanliness of the waiting, treatment areas and the toilet facility.

### **Recommendations**

Based on the findings of this study, the following recommendations were made;

1. Management of Primary Health Care (PHC) facilities should focus on the quality, cleanliness, responsiveness of services, as well as a focus on improving the communication skills of staff in terms of compassion, politeness and active listening.
2. Nurses should likewise develop interpersonal skills such as active listening, empathy, compassion, acknowledging and valuing individual's perspectives so as to not underestimate and undertreat patients



3. Nigeria primary healthcare system should support quality improvement activities, effective leadership and partnership development to ensure sustainability and effectiveness in the provision of quality healthcare services.
4. Regular advocacy programs should be carried out by nurses within the community as this might draw public attention to the significance of primary healthcare.
5. Nurses and other health care providers in PHC facilities should improve on timely discharge of their duties to patients.

## References

- Berghout, M., Excel, J. V., Leensvaart, L., & Cramm, J. M. (2015). Healthcare professionals' views on patient-centered care in hospitals. *BMC Health Services Research*, 15(385), 01-13. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-015-1049-z>.
- Calvillo, E.J., Skog, A. P., Tenner, A. G. & Wallis, L. A., (2015). Applying the lessons of maternal mortality reduction to global emergency health. *PMC Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 93(6), 417-423. <https://dx.doi.org/10.2471%2FBLT.14.146571>
- Ephraim-Emmanuel, B. C., Adigwe, A., Oyeghe, R., & Ogaji, D. S. (2018). Quality of health care in Nigeria: A myth or a reality. *International Journal of Research in Medical Sciences*, 6(9), 2875-3881. <https://doi.org/10.18203/2320-6012ijrsm20183621>
- Ibrahim, Y. S., Mohtar, S., & Goron Dutse, A. H. (2015). Patient perception on service quality improvement among public and private healthcare providers in Nigeria and Malaysia. *World Journal of Preventive Medicine*, 3(4), 84-93. <https://doi.org/10.12691/jpm-3-4-1>.
- Javed, S. A., Liu, S., Mahmoudi, A., & Nawaz, M. (2018). Patients' satisfaction and public and private sectors' health care service quality in Pakistan: Application of grey decision analysis approaches. *International Journal of Health Planning and Management*, 34(1), 01 - 15. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hpm.2629>.
- Kauser, A. K., Shahzad, A. K., Zubia, Q. & Moazzam, A. K. (2017), Patient's satisfaction towards quality of health services: An assessment at primary healthcare of district Gujranwala. *International Journal of Public Health Science*, 6, 7-12. <https://doi.org/10.11591/v6i1.6526>.
- Khan, M., Khalid, P., Almorsy, L., & Khalifa, M. (2016). Improving Timeliness of Diagnostic Healthcare Services: Effective Strategies and Recommendations. *IOS Press*, 226 (1), 183-186. <https://doi.org/10.3233/978-1-61499-664-4-183>.
- Kudra, K. & Bernard, N., (2014). Patients' level of satisfaction on quality of health care at Mwananyamala hospital in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. *BMC Health Services Research*, 14(1), 400. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6963-14-400>.
- Ogunyemi, A. O., Ogunyemi, A. A., Olufunlayo, T. F., & Odugbemi, T. O. (2019). Patient satisfaction with services at public and faithbased primary health centres in Lagos State: A comparative study. *Journal of clinical science*. 16(3), 75-80. [https://dx.doi.org/10.4103/jcls.jcls\\_39\\_18](https://dx.doi.org/10.4103/jcls.jcls_39_18).
- O'Neil, S., Naeve, K., & Rajani, V. (2017). An examination of the Maternal Health Quality of Care Landscape in India. Cambridge: Mathematical Policy Research pg 10-13. Retrieved on March 11, 2020 from [https://www.macfound.org/media/files/50268\\_Landscape\\_Report\\_2017.03.02.pdf](https://www.macfound.org/media/files/50268_Landscape_Report_2017.03.02.pdf)
- Tariq, A. M., & Abdurrahman, A. (2016). An Evaluation of Primary Healthcare Facilities (PHC) Services. *Health Science Journal*, 10 (2), 15. Retrieved on March 12, 2020 from <https://www.hsj.gr/medicine/an-evaluation-of-primary-healthcare-facilities-phc-services-the-views-of-users.pdf>



- World Health Organization. (2020). Maternal health in Nigeria: generating information for action. Geneva: WHO. Retrieved on March 11, 2021 from <https://www.who.int/reproductivehealth/maternal-health-nigeria/en/>
- World Health Organization. (2019). Primary Health Care. Geneva: WHO Press. Retrieved on March 19, 2021 from [https://www.who.int/health-topics/primary-health-care#tab=tab\\_1](https://www.who.int/health-topics/primary-health-care#tab=tab_1)

### Cite this article:

**Author(s)**, BAMIDELE, Feyisayo Iyabo (RN, RM, RNE, BNSc, MPH), OKAFOR, Ngozi Anthonia (RN, RM, RPHN, PhD), (2021). "Assessment of Perceived Quality of Healthcare Services by Out-Patients Attending Primary Healthcare Facilities in A Selected Local Government Area in Kwara State, Nigeria". **Name of the Journal:** Commonwealth Journal of Academic Research, (CJAR.EU), P, 1- 15. DOI: <http://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4746958> , Issue: 4, Vol.: 2, Article: 1, Month: April, Year: 2021. Retrieved from <https://www.cjar.eu/all-issues/>

### Published by



AND

ThoughtWares Consulting & Multi Services International (TWCMSI)

